



Recommend

HOME PAGE TODAY'S PAPER VIDEO MOST POPULAR TIMES TOPICS

Get Home Delivery Welcome, furdx Log Out Help

The New York Times

Science

Search All NYTimes.com Go

WORLD U.S. N.Y. / REGION BUSINESS TECHNOLOGY SCIENCE HEALTH SPORTS OPINION ARTS STYLE TRAVEL JOBS REAL ESTATE AUTOS ENVIRONMENT SPACE & COSMOS



Great cooking just got easy.

kitchendaily

find out more

Advertise on NYTimes.com

At Internet Conference, Signs of Agreement Between U.S. and Russia

By JOHN MARKOFF
Published: April 15, 2010

GARMISCH-PARTENKIRCHEN, Germany — For the 140 computer network specialists, law enforcement agents and diplomats from eight countries who met in this German ski resort this week for a Russian-sponsored conference on Internet security, the biggest challenge was finding a common ground to discuss their differences.

The barrier was not the gaggle of native languages but the deep differences in the way governments view cyberspace, according to many of the cyberspecialists at the conference.

That challenge was underscored by a sharp rift between the United States and Russia. Americans speak about computer security and cyberwarfare; the Russians have a different emphasis, describing cyberspace in a broader framework they refer to as “information security.”

“The Russians have a dramatically different definition of information security than we do; it’s a broader notion, and they really mean state security,” said George Sadowsky, a United States representative to the [Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers](#), or Icaann, the organization that is the closest thing to a governing body for the global network.

What has changed, however, is the Obama administration’s decision this year to actively begin discussing these differences with the Russians. While last year only a single American academic computer security specialist attended the conference, this year more than a dozen Americans attended, including Christopher Painter, the second ranking White House official on cybersecurity, and Judith Strotz, the director of the State Department’s Office of Cyber Affairs.

The two nations, according to Russian officials, have agreed to renew bilateral discussions that began last November in Washington.

“An international dialogue on cybergovernance, crime and security is really long overdue,” said Charles Barry, a research fellow at the National Defense University. “There’s really only one network out there. We’re all on it, and we need to make it safe.”

Mr. Painter, speaking on Tuesday, said there had been significant improvement in international law enforcement cooperation in recent years. To respond to challenges in cyberspace, he said, strong laws, trained cybercrime investigators and efficient

RECOMMEND

TWITTER

E-MAIL

SEND TO PHONE

PRINT

REPRINTS

SHARE

RSS Feed
RSS Get Science News From The New York Times »

Politics E-Mail

Keep up with the latest news from Washington with the daily Politics e-mail newsletter. See [Sample furd@mit.edu](#) Sign Up Change E-mail Address Privacy Policy

Ads by Google what's this?

- FreeConferenceCall.com**
24/7 Unlimited Free Conferencing. Calls. Easy Sign Up Online! [FreeConferenceCall.com](#)
- Whole Foods Market**
Lets Save The Planet One Coupon at a Time. [www.WholeFoodsMarket.com](#)
- Cloud Identity Summit**
Register for hands-on cloud identity security training. [www.CloudIdentitySummit.com](#)
- IS Security Certificate**
Earn Your IS Security Master Certificate 100% Online-Villanova! [VillanovaU.com](#)
- Network Security Major**
Need Network Security Training? Great courses are offered at ACII! [www.AmericanCareerInstitute.info](#)
- International Conference**
International Video/ Web/ Tele Conferences. Great Rates & Service. [www.ConferenceGroup.com](#)

Advertise on NYTimes.com

MOST POPULAR

E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED VIEWED

- The Curious Cook: Cilantro Haters, It's Not Your Fault
- Poll Finds Tea Party Backers Wealthier and More Educated
- Can the Jewish Deli Be Reformed?
- 10 Simple Google Search Tricks
- Magazine Preview: The Estrogen Dilemma
- For Students, a Waiting List Is Scant Hope
- Embracing a Life of Solitude
- Op-Ed Contributor: Our Fill-in-the-Blank Constitution
- Volcanic Ash Closes Down Air Traffic in North Europe
- News Analysis: Obama Speech Signals a U.S. Shift on Middle East

Go to Complete List »

international cooperation are needed.

The United States has succeeded in creating a global 24-hour, seven-day network of law enforcement agencies in 50 nations, which have agreed to collect and share data in response to computer attacks and intrusions. While officials from both nations said that law enforcement cooperation had improved, the Russians have still refused to sign the European Cybercrime Treaty, which is strongly backed by the United States.

At the same time, for the past 13 years, the Russians have been trying to interest the United States in a cyberspace treaty in which nations would agree not to develop offensive cyberweapons or to conduct attacks on computer networks. The United States has repeatedly declined to enter into negotiations, arguing instead that improved law enforcement cooperation between different countries was all that was necessary to combat both cybercrime and cyberterrorism.

On Monday, Gen. Vladislav P. Sherstyuk, Russia's undersecretary of the security council of the Russian Federation and the former leader of the Russian equivalent of the [National Security Agency](#), criticized the treaty, saying that a single provision effectively violated Russia's sovereignty by permitting foreign law enforcement direct access to the Russian Internet.

He also restated Russian concerns about the absence of an international treaty limiting the military uses of the Internet. "Cyberattacks are left out of international military law," he said. "Information technology can be used as a tool to undermine national peace and security."

The Americans have accused the Russians of turning a blind eye to cybercriminals who have operated with relative impunity from their country. In response, the Russians have criticized what they see as the United States' "hegemony" over the Internet and privately expressed concerns that the United States has retained a "red button" — the power to shut off the Internet for specific countries.

Yet despite these differences, in Garmisch this year there were also signs of agreement between Russians and Americans.

The conference, which is sponsored by Lomonosov Moscow State University, Icanm and several Russian companies, is the brainchild of General Sherstyuk. Several of the conference attendees said the gathering, which is in its fourth year, was an effort by General Sherstyuk to build international support for his work. He has been the principal force behind Russian efforts to create a treaty limiting cyberwarfare developments.

Academic and government officials from a number of other countries, including India and China, attended this year. However, recent episodes like [Google's](#) claims in January that it had suffered the theft of its software and intrusions on human rights advocates from China and a recent Canadian report about a Chinese computer spying system focused on India, were not discussed.

During a panel on countering computer crime, Col. Gen. Boris Miroshnikov, a cybercrime official for the Russian Ministry of the Interior, and Stewart Baker, a fellow at the [Center for Strategic and International Studies](#), a policy group in Washington, and the former chief counsel for the [National Security Council](#), agreed that the most important step in combating Internet crime would be to do away with the anonymity that has long been a central tenet of Internet culture.

"Anonymity is an invitation to criminals," said Colonel General Miroshnikov.

Mr. Baker agreed, saying, "Anonymity is the fundamental problem we face in cyberspace."

This week, the Russians were optimistic that progress was being made in bridging more of the cultural divide that has hindered international cooperation.



Review: "Lend Me a Tenor"

ALSO IN THEATER »

[Choosing gay identity in old Hollywood](#)
[Old hickory, rock star president](#)

nytimes.com

THEATER

ADVERTISEMENTS

[Follow us on Twitter](#)

[Watch today's top videos](#)

[See the news in the making. Watch TimesCast, a daily news video.](#)

[Find your dream home with The New York Times Real Estate](#)



According to one Russian business executive who has attended all four of the Garmisch events, the tenor of this year’s meeting was markedly different than earlier meetings, which were dominated by the Russians. “In the past, the largest group was from the F.S.B.,” he said, referring to the Russian intelligence agency, “who were here for an annual vacation.”

Times Reader 2.0: Daily delivery of The Times - straight to your computer. Subscribe for just \$4.62 a week.

E-MAIL
PRINT
REPRINTS

Ads by Google

[what's this?](#)

Philips ALS Monitor/Defib

Leading the way in emergency care for EMS and hospitals. Act Now!
www.philips.com/alsdefib

Russian Visa

Procedure for obtaining a Russian visa consists of three steps
www.r-tg.com

VOIP For \$8.33 / Month

Unlimited Calling, Voice Mail, Free Setup & 2nd Line. No Contract
www.PhonePower.com

Related Searches

- Cyberattacks and Cyberwarfare
- Computer Security
- Computers and the Internet
- Russia

- [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



ART & DESIGN »



Museum's Deal Raises Hope and Eyebrows

HOME & GARDEN »



Embracing a Life of Solitude

OPINION »

Op-Ed: Life on the Wait List
Getting stuck on a wait list doesn't make the college application process any easier.

N.Y. / REGION »



Archbishop Is Praised in First Year as Tests Await

OPINION »



Letters: Wall Street, and the Search for Blame

FASHION & STYLE »



Bull Market? Try Peacock

[Home](#) | [World](#) | [U.S.](#) | [N.Y. / Region](#) | [Business](#) | [Technology](#) | [Science](#) | [Health](#) | [Sports](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Arts](#) | [Style](#) | [Travel](#) | [Jobs](#) | [Real Estate](#) | [Autos](#) | [Back to Top](#)

Copyright 2010 The New York Times Company | [Privacy](#) | [Terms of Service](#) | [Search](#) | [Corrections](#) | [RSS](#) | [First Look](#) | [Help](#) | [Contact Us](#) | [Work for Us](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Site Map](#)

MORE IN SCIENCE (2 OF 42 ARTICLES)

U.S. Leads New Bid to Phase Hunting

[Read More »](#)